Cultivating Professional Lives of Purpose: Collegiate Experiences and Vocational Awareness

Presented to the Jon C. Dalton Institute on College Student Values
February 5, 2011

Jennifer Discher
Mercy Health Partners, Toledo, Ohio; University of Toledo

Lee Krähenbühl
Mercy College of Northwest Ohio, Toledo, Ohio

Carol Schwartz
University of Toledo, Toledo, Ohio
Educating for citizenship continues to undergird the mission of higher education, both public and private. The purpose of this presentation will be to articulate what curricular and co-curricular aspects of the college experience lead to the development of professionals who are mission-minded, socially responsible, vocationally aware, and civically engaged. In other words, “how do we prepare students for disciplinary excellence, a successful career, and a meaningful life?” One specific case study will include formation of mission-mindedness in future health care employees.
Background of Higher Education/Civic Engagement/Student Development

Share our own stories of threshold between our past lives and our professional vocation

Introduction to Backward Design

Narrative Analysis: Storytelling

Particular case of health care
Higher education is an integral part of the process of nurturing and sustaining responsible civic engagement.

The academy should “make for less misery among the poor, less ignorance in the schools, less suffering in the hospital, less fraud in business, [and] less folly in politics.”

(Daniel Coit Gilman, Fleming & Brabeck, 2002, p. 82)
Background: Higher Education, Civic Engagement, and Student Development

- Discipline of rhetoric in ancient Greece
- Rise of the Medieval universities
- Colonial-era American Education
- Present-day Context
Social Reconstructionism: A philosophy that emphasizes the addressing of social questions and a quest to create a better society and worldwide democracy.

- Brameld
- Oakes and Lipton
- Melchin
Educating for citizenship continues to undergird the mission of higher education, both public and private.

The relevance and effectiveness of institutions of higher education depends upon the creation of:

- meaningful curricular and co-curricular learning experiences
- developmentally appropriate opportunities for responsible citizenship in undergraduate education
- awareness of what an adult understanding of, and commitment to, civic engagement looks like.
Arguably, the most promulgated and adopted pedagogy for the educational outcome of civic engagement is Service Learning.

- First coined in 1967, in reference to an internship program that was sponsored by the Southern Regional Education Board.


- Bringle and Hatcher, Howard, Zlotkowski, Eyler and Giles, et al.
Effective higher education empowers students to apply life-changing cognitive structures which incline their behaviors in such constructive directions as civic engagement.

- **Piaget:** learning begins with the “accommodation of mental structures to reality”

- **Freire:** to teach is to create the possibilities for the construction of knowledge

- **Bloom:** cognitive taxonomy...classifying is the intended behavior of students

- **Gardner:** education for understanding

- **Barr and Tagg:** communities of learners
Effective education pays careful attention to the process of learning to achieve a quality outcome, and the optimal environment employs holistic attention to spiritual, intellectual, and psychological being.

Baxter Magolda’s dimensions of development:
- how we know or decide what to believe,
- how we view ourselves
- how we construct relationships with others
- “self-authorship”: student awareness of being at once both individuals and members of a community
The stages in Chickering’s and Reisser’s developmental process are called vectors.

Vectors six and seven in the model
- deal with developing purpose and integrity
- orient learning opportunities toward “clear vocational goals, sustained and rewarding activities, strong interpersonal and family connections, humanizing values, social responsibility, congruence, and responsibility”
King’s Reflective Judgment Model

- pre-reflective thinking
- quasi-reflective thinking
- reflective thinking.

Lonergan, Gelpi & Melchin: conversion (Metanoia, μετάνοια): is the “fundamental reorientation of one’s whole life... a process of shifting and expanding our frame of reference or horizons” in five areas of development

- affective
- intellectual
- moral
- sociopolitical
- religious
Astin documents specific types of student involvement within the college environment that can impact social activism:

- participating in community action programs
- helping others in difficulty
- influencing social values
- influencing the political structure
Discuss

Share your stories of threshold between your past lives and your professional vocation.

- For some, this happens in a single moment of clarity.
- For others, this experience is a series of events that more gradually bring our vocational direction into focus.
Understanding by Design
The Backward Design Approach

Carol Schwartz, M.Ed.
University of Toledo
Establishing Priorities

Worth being familiar with

Important to know and do

Enduring Understanding
Understanding by Design (UbD)
Wiggins and McTighe (1998)

Identify Desired Results
Determine Acceptable Evidence
Plan Instruction & Learning Experiences
Right-to-Left Planning
Starting with the Outcome

Learning Outcome
What will the student know/be able to do?

Assessment
How will you know the student achieved this?

Instruction & Resources
What will it take to get the student there?
Six Facets of Understanding

- **Explanation**
- **Interpretation**
- **Application**
- **Perspective**
- **Empathy**
- **Self-Knowledge**

Requires students to determine and organize meanings. The use of narratives can deepen understanding—with a dash of ambiguity—that allows students to “make their own meaning.”
Bloom’s Affective Domain

- Receiving Phenomena
- Responding to Phenomena
- Valuing
- Organizing
- Internalizing
UbD in Curricular Practice

- Complements and intersects with other curricular constructs, e.g. Bloom’s Taxonomy
- Applies to “enduring understandings” as well as what is important to know
- Constructivist in approach when filtering for “enduring understanding”
  - Rather than measuring only performance, facets of understanding can be assessed
Bloom’s Taxonomy

Cognitive

Psychomotor

Affective
Cognitive

LOTS
- Knowledge
- Comprehension
- Application

HOTS
- Analysis
- Synthesis
- Evaluation
“We Live By Stories”
Listening to the Voices of Purposeful Lives

Lee Krähenbühl, Ph.D.
Mercy College of Northwest Ohio
Aristotle’s response to Plato: *mimesis*

Bruner: “We live by stories, and they’re what give sense to our lives.”

Hawkins: Narrative is *relationship*
Making Sense of Experience

Cohen et al, 2000; Coffey & Atkinson, 1996

Narrative is **chronicle**

Narrative is **performance**

Narrative is **ethnopoetics**
Life Themes and Formative Forces

Csikszentmihalyi & Beattie, 1979; Goodson & Adair, 2007; Baxter Magolda keynote, 2011

Personal scripts become life theme, which forms vocational identity (see also Baxter Magolda’s “internal voice” yesterday)

Primal Learning (see also Baxter Magolda’s “internal foundation”) and Narrative Learning

Three interdependent formative forces: exterior, interior, and interactive
The Labov Model of Narrative Analysis

(Labov & Waletzky; 1967; Labov, 1972)

Abstract  Evaluation
Orientation  Result or
Complication  Resolution

Coda
Narrative “Selfing” and Voice-Giving
McAdams, 1996; Peck, 1993; Coffey & Atkinson, 1996; Goodson, 1995

- McAdams’ “Selfing”:
  narrative ownership and agency

- Peck: “meeting the crises early”

- Narrative gives voice to those otherwise silenced
College experience, while not designed to foster particular religious beliefs and practices, has always had a strong philosophical basis regarding the purposes of citizenship, democracy, and the improvement of society. At the same time that Catholic health care is experiencing a decline in an intentionally Catholic-culture-educated workforce, emergent pedagogies such as “service learning” have surfaced. It therefore makes sense to examine college experience and its implications for preparing a socially engaged or mission-minded workforce.
Particular Case: Catholic Health Care

Parallel values
Civic Virtue and Mission Commitment
Mission-Minded Behaviors & Characteristics

- Hiring for organizational fit
  - “New hires in Catholic health care... are assessed not only for their skills and ‘job fit’ but also for their personal values and integrity, their ways of making decisions, and their personal character (as revealed by their general behavior), all of which must be taken into consideration in assessments of ‘organizational fit’” (O’Toole, 2006p. 36).
- Hiring a skilled workforce
- Hiring for commitment to bioethics, community benefit, advocacy, charity care, community outreach, healthcare education, disease prevention and management, and other core values.
  - Compassion, service, justice, excellence, stewardship, care of the poor, human dignity, sacredness of life, etc.
  - Sisters of Mercy Health System in St. Louis
  - Alexian Brothers Medical Center in Elk Grove, IL
“Backward Design” (Wiggins and McTighe in Understanding by Design):

- An educational and curriculum development model that begins with the end in mind
- Begins with a series of questions in three areas:
  - identifying desired results
  - determining acceptable evidence
  - planning learning experiences
- In this study, the desired result is civic engagement and mission commitment
- The acceptable evidence is recognition from multitude of sources, nomination process for mission and/or service award
- Now...what type of learning experiences work...or in other words:
What curricular and co-curricular aspects of the college experience lead to the development of mission-minded, socially responsible, civically engaged professionals? More specifically, what college-related activities and undergraduate experiences contribute to the formation of mission-mindedness in nursing professionals working within Catholic health care institutions?
In the process of data collection, through reflection on observations, notes, and a close study of verbatim transcriptions of interviews, I utilized Labov’s approach, as well as the work of Coffey, Atkinson, and Riessman to create a structural framework to analyze the collected narratives. One such structure includes the elements of abstract, orientation, complicating action, evaluation, result or resolution, and coda (Labov & Waletzky, 1967, pp. 32-39).
Narrative analysis uses structural elements of story to preserve the meaning of the narrator’s experience through an organic process rather than an artificial, pseudo-objective classification. The narrator’s perspective, rather than the perspective of the researcher, drives the process. As Connelly and Clandinin (1990) state “at the heart of narrative analysis lie the ways humans experience the world” (p. 2).
Structural Framework: Liza

Transcript: MZSC011811
Theme Unit: 1 – Receiving the award
Lines: 1-23

ABSTRACT
[9-10] [The award] has always been the prestigious award that you are looking for and you really like to get that.

ORIENTATION
[10] It means that you were nominated by one of your peers.

COMPLICATION
[10-15] They write down all of your qualities and why they think that you should receive that award. Once all of the papers are collected and the Metro Board meets, they then look over everything and they choose which one out of this group is deserving to get the award. A lot of it has to do with the writer too, you know how eloquent they are with their writing, and how that might catch the judges eye, you know those kinds of things.

EVALUATION
[15-20] I have done a lot of things at St. Columba and for St. Columba and in the name of St. Columba, I have such a passion for all of that. [. . .] It used to be only at St. Columba and they would have a dinner after Nurses Week in May, that is where they would do it. Then it got to be that all of the [system] (Anthony's, St. X's and us) would meet together and have a big dinner and they did it in front of that whole group. [. . .]

RESULT or RESOLUTION
[17] I was very pleased to receive that. It is very exciting.

CODA
Structural Framework: Liza

Transcript: MZSC011811.
Theme Unit: 2 - Mission commitment at work
Lines: 26-53

ABSTRACT

[26] [. . . ] passionate [. . . ] is the word that I truly feel after all of these many years of nursing, which would be almost 43 years.

ORIENTATION

[29-41] Just as little as a smile from this little old fellow that you have been trying to get to smile all day long and he has just been pretty grouchy or in pain, and then all of a sudden you coax that little smile out, you know that is just so worth every effort that you have done. To know that you have made their day. Sure, thanks and all of those things are great, but some of those other ones are just that extra bonus. [. . . ] I try to put everything that I can into every single day and then the teamwork that comes with knowing that a lot of these girls that I work with maybe the whole 30 years that I have been here we are still working on the floor together. I is just marvelous, we can anticipate each other, what our needs are.

COMPLICATION

[39-46] When I was a charge nurse I could say "Well, she does not do too good with alcoholic people", and this person who loves to deal with that would get that and you know she would shine in that area. So you would find a place where each one would shine. You just knew it. Along with some of that the girls would say "You have got your mom smiling again". You could just go by a room and you see a nurse sitting on the bedside and patting the patient, talking to them and calming them down, reassuring, teaching or whatever, and doing it all in the warmth that you know it should be done.

EVALUATION

[34-35] I would really like to see nurses dedicated and not just there for the job. I have made it truly a career [. . . ]

[46-48] I guess that is my feel for nursing that I hope will continue with all that huge, huge, technical aspect of what is going on. I feel we are losing quite a bit of that and it breaks my heart to see that.

RESULT or RESOLUTION


Liza: Sometimes it is impossible because of the demands over here, maybe we should let go of some of those little demands and go back to this. That has been a really huge depressing point in my life in the last couple of years.

CODA

[27-29] I would do it all over again if I had the choice, either that or carpentry, but I think that nursing would be the one. It is just so rewarding to be helping people in their time of need.
Structural Framework: Liza

Transcript: MZSC011811
Theme Unit: 3 - Balancing technical demands and the human connection
Lines: 54-79, 133-138

ABSTRACT
[63-66] Jen: I witness, from an outside perspective, that things are added onto nursing layer by layer by layer and things are not taken away. That is why when I look at nursing I think that it is the axis point for what goes on in our hospitals.
Liza: I think that is the whole core of patient satisfaction and family satisfaction.

ORIENTATION
[56-61] Yes, and the computer well I am not very computer savvy, but I am getting better and better. That is not the point you know, it is the point that you have to do this computer stuff. You know the patient might need this or need that and then "Okay I will be right back" and then you go do the computer and then you forget, not that you want to, it is just that there are so many things swirling in your mind.

COMPLICATION
[66-71] If your nurse is terribly distressed and is trying to do way too many tasks, and trying to complete them all, I would say that almost anybody that goes into nursing (I am making a big general statement) they have this certain ethical feel to them that these things have to be done in such a manner for the patient satisfaction and family satisfaction and the nurse satisfaction.

EVALUATION
[71-73] If you cannot meet those something gets lost in you and it shows outwardly, and the patient and the family can feel it, and then that the satisfaction field goes down because they feel it is like a tension, or something [...] [133-138] I think that they are the ones that have been around, we have worked together for 25 - 32 years, those are the most passionate, the ones that you can see are just so upset that they can't do the exact kind of nursing that they want to do anymore. They are the ones that are most upset. They are the ones that know all the technical stuff also, but to us it feels like that should be the bottom line and the other part should come first. These people are probably ages 48 to 61.

RESULT or RESOLUTION
[60-61] Somebody may be needing something for pain, you go grab that, while you have forgotten the other.

CODA
[78-79] I would love to give it back to the others. Who is to judge......I know the money counts for everything but...............
Transcript: **MZSC011811**  
Theme Unit: Civic engagement, faith and family  
Lines: **148-174; 263-264**  

**ABSTRACT**  

**[148-150]** OK ...... I am not a strong church person but I still feel very close to God, you things like that, but in my own way. I help my kids all the time, I am sure all moms do that. The other thing is Relay for Life [ . . . ] **[173-174]** I do heart walk every year, I am the team captain on that. I really get into everything.  

**ORIENTATION**  

**[150-152]** I come from a family of 10 kids and my sister who is 3 years younger than I am developed breast cancer when she was about age 49.  

**COMPLICATION**  

**[152-154]** It was a really tough struggle for her and I had to almost carry her to chemotherapy because she did not want to go, but she knew she had to, she is a nurse. I took a CTO day and I would take her and we would spend the day together.  

**EVALUATION**  

**[154-156]** Just because I knew she needed someone there [ . . . ] I was very delighted to do it, it was not a struggle it was a pleasure to do it.  

**RESULT or RESOLUTION**  

**[156-171]** That is why I started Relay for Life to be really energetic about that. At first I started to get all of the girls [ . . . ] to bake something for our bake sale. That became an annual bake sale and I bet we had 8-10 of those now, so that many years at least. So everybody bakes and one nurse brings in 15 Bundt cakes [ . . . ] We then have our bake sale on Monday. We make anywhere from $600 to $1000 bucks every bake sale [ . . . ]  

........... you know how many brownies that is? We did a cookbook and outpatient pharmacy is still selling those books.  

**CODA**  

**[171-173]** After our last bake sale I put all the money that they have earned throughout the rest of this year now, I have $500 bucks in my safe at home that is from the cook books after the bake sale. **[263-264]** I like to organize you know at both places. I have always been known for a very, very positive manner.
ABSTRACT

[181-184] I think RN was above me at that time. I did the LPN for about 15 years and then I went back to school. I think maybe my mom or dad never said "Oh don't be an LPN be an RN". They never did any of that. They supported me. I don't think that I ever wanted to do anything else at that young age. [...] it was never pushed on me. My mom did not work while we were growing up.

ORIENTATION

[177-180] I was a Clara Jane in high school. My dad was a doctor and my mom was an RN. One of my girlfriends down the street when we were in grade school she became an LPN. She kind of talked me into the LPN part. I think that I needed to start there as I was extremely shy and timid and I think that was where I needed to start. I had catholic [school] all the way through. I went to St. Mary’s, Our Lady of Sorrows, went to St. Catherine High School, then Visitation.

COMPPLICATION

[195-224] It always feel like a closer knit, you are part of the group I think. I had to take some of my classes at City University and Ohio Community College. A couple of the classes I was never on the roster until halfway through. They were lie "don't worry your on it" and then you are shaking in your boots and then finally you end up on the roster. But City University they were just not as organized. I went to Assisi College too for a couple. At Assisi, I went in there, and the little nun took my hand........"OK honey come over here and she would walk me over to pay my fee, then she took me to get my books, she was delightful. [...] you're not just another person sitting on that chair. When I took chemistry at Assisi the nun at the end she knitted us little pot holders and she put on each one what she thought our personalities were. [...] I feel she had mine down to a T........"You take care of people especially you lab partner" who was never on time........you know this young thing I figured oh well I will help her. I did not care. I think that she had us down to a T. We were individuals to her. Not just a person sitting in her class.

At Visitation for my R.N. I think those instructors were very strong, they were very rigid in their rules, which I was very appreciative of. I knew what I was dealing with, you know working full time and going through Visitation full time, with Visitation being one of the harder schools, then 3 kids age 7/8, and 9 and over 40 :)).........Okay now this assignment is due on this day and if you don't have it done then you are knocked down 2 grades, or whatever. I would always get mine in on time. The kids that lived in the dorms I though okay you are here and you do not have to work. I was watching to see if they got theirs in on time too, there was one that did not and she got the lower grade. [...] 

EVALUATION

[224-227] I think that [Visitation’s rigidity] was very important and the Visitation instructors were very strong on that, on the floor they were very strong, they were knowledgeable. To this day I think that the Visitation graduates have the better bedside manner, clinical know-how, smarts, because of those instructors.

RESULT or RESOLUTION

[204] At Assisi I had the feeling that you're not just another person sitting on that chair.

CODA

[236-240] Top notch [instructors are] tough but necessarily so, I truly feel that we have to be that way with the new grads.
My daughter is an R.N. [ . . . She went to Ohio Community College, then] went to Visitation for her BSN and she is doing very well . . . . Nurse Practitioner at City University. [She now works] here. Sometimes she floats.

She will come up to me and say "Okay mom, I did this for the pt, and I called the doctor for this . . . . . . I say "oh good".

It always reminds me of the Fonzie moment you know he goes to comb his hair and like "Oh it is good enough" and that is how I feel. I am so grateful.
[277] A mission-committed person is someone who goes above and beyond and continuously not just a sporadic move here [and there]; someone who is positive, you know above your job description, how do I want to say this, not above your job description but a continuation of it past what is really expected [. . .]

[289-290] [. . .] highly motivated, a passion for nursing and your quality of care, your ethics in your nursing. The time clock does not really mean anything.

[291-297] I have always felt like you know "hey you guys you can't go on break everybody is sinking here". Most of the people that I work with their breaks or lunches go aside or they bring their lunch to the report room so they are right there on the floor in case somebody needs something. That is just, at least in my unit I am not sure about other units, but we have worked together for so many, many, years that we have a cohesiveness. I can see a little bit of that breaking, just a little bit because their workload is so difficult without a charge nurse type thing.

[280-283] It is great that someone can recognize that, what you are doing, even though you are doing it quietly. Most of the time it does not feel like an effort to do it, you know that is what I expect of myself, and it gives me great pleasure to do those things. I am glad that somebody appreciates that.
ABSTRACT

I think that Michigan Christian University definitely made me think about reflectively looking at nursing. One instructor she was a Faith in Community instructor. That is what my focus was, faith in community and nursing.

ORIENTATION

when I went to Ohio Community College I was 18 years old and I always thought that I wanted to go off to school, you know I thought I could try to go to Midwest State University or I could try to get a scholarship somewhere else, but you know at the same time I did not want to be away from my family. I always thought that my family needed me and I can't leave, I have to help my mom and my dad or I have to help my sister. There is always someone in need.

COMPLICATION

At that point there was some struggle between my mom and dad and so I really did not want to leave. And then I had just started dating my husband at that time too, so I thought well I am just going to go to Ohio Community College. That was always kind of the plan. I had some thoughts about going to other colleges but I thought that Ohio Community College would be simple, it is nearby, it is convenient, I can get into the nursing program and finish up in 2 years and then start working. I think that mainly what kept me here is my family nearby and it worked out that way because when I was in nursing school my sister was diagnosed with non-Hodgkin's lymphoma. [..] so we lived together already and she had a 3 year old daughter that she adopted and she was a single parent, and I was in nursing school, and I was working and she got sick, so I stayed and helped her. She would get sick often and she would throw up and I would just be there to help her. I would take her daughter for her and you know take her to go play or take her to see Santa or different things, I took care of her 3-year-old a lot and stayed there with her. I would hold her throw up puking bucket.

EVALUATION

You get busy on the floor so much, you know you work your 12 hours and you get home (actually it is more like 13-14 hours that you are working). You just do not have time to think about what you did all day, you just want to go to bed or you have to go home and take care of your kids, take care of home, and then go to bed, maybe. Finally, you know by midnight and hopefully get a full night's rest.

RESULT or RESOLUTION

I guess she kind of helped everyone see, reflectively, throughout the day like what you are doing at that time.

CODA

So instead of looking back, just like know what you are doing at the time when you are doing it, as far as being a nurse, being a person. [..] She was not really focusing on the nursing, the tasks, she was focusing around the nurse as a person.
Jennifer Discher
jennifer_discher@mhsnr.org

Lee Krähenbühl
Lee.Krahnenbuhl@mercycollege.edu

Carol Schwartz
Carol.Schwartz@utoledo.edu

Thank you!
REFERENCES


REFERENCES (continued)


REFERENCES (continued)


